School Ethics Commission Meeting Public Session Minutes

November 22, 2022

Chairperson Robert Bender called the meeting of the School Ethics Commission (Commission or SEC) to order at 9:38 a.m.

Notice of the meeting was provided to the State House Press Corps and the Secretary of State, and filed as required by the Open Public Meetings Act.

I. Roll Call

Roll Call	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Carol E. Sabo	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Present	X		X	X	X		X	5
Absent		X				X		2

Also, in attendance were Kathryn Whalen, Esquire, Director, Office of Legal Affairs and School Ethics; Jeannine Pizzigoni, staff member; and Carolyn Labin and Laurie Fichera, Deputy Attorneys General (DAsG). Everyone in attendance at the meeting participated via telephone/video.

II. First Public Comment

At the start of the meeting, Chairperson Bender explained to the public (who also accessed the meeting by telephone/video) how the meeting would be conducted. More specifically, Chairperson Bender explained that the public would be afforded the opportunity to provide public comment regarding his/her case; the Commission would then adjourn to executive session (on a different conference line); the Commission would return to public at approximately 12:30 p.m.; at that time, members of the public would be afforded another opportunity to provide public comment in connection with his/her case; and then the Commission would vote on matters pertinent to its business.

The Commission's staff also advised the public as follows: individuals wishing to provide public comments/statements during First and Second Public Comment must be speaking about matters on the Commission's agenda; anyone wishing to provide public comments/statements about a matter not on the agenda should reserve their public comments/statements for New Business; anyone offering public comments/statements about a matter on the agenda is asked not to relitigate the merits of their case as the Commission's review of matters is limited to the written submissions; and everyone in attendance is asked to exercise an appropriate degree of decorum as this is a public forum.

9:42 a.m. Sarah Aziz, interested party in the matter docketed as C85-22, noted her attendance, and offered a statement summarized as follow:

My name is Sarah Aziz and I'm calling about case C85-22. I urge the Commission to not dismiss this case or put it in abeyance. There are currently three other Monroe ethics

complaints that are in abeyance because ethics complaint C03-21 filed in February 2021 is still pending before the Office of Administrative Law for over a year. The respondent, in case C03-21 now only has six weeks left in this term and they altogether evade accountability while violating the School Ethics Act. The longer other Monroe cases are held in abeyance due to the delay in adjudicating this particular case, the more damage is done to our school district. These board members feel that they can continue to violate the School Ethics Act with impunity and face no justice while in office. Finally, the facts and circumstances in case C85-22 are unique, compelling, and a completely unrelated to the issues in case C03-21 or any other Monroe ethics complaint and therefore should not be dismissed or held in abeyance.

9:44 a.m. Olivia Lancpot, counsel on behalf of Respondents in the matters docketed as C74-22 and C86-22, noted her attendance, but did not offer any public comments/statements.

9:45 a.m. Lauren Connell-Madia, counsel on behalf of Respondents in the matters docketed as C69-22 and C70-22, noted her attendance and offered a statement summarized as follows:

Good morning. My name is Lauren Connelll-Madia, on behalf of Respondents Dana Beltran and Judith Bassford on the case C69-22 and C70-22. I understand that no argument is to be made. I would just like to remind the Commission that since the filing of the complaints against these two Respondents, everything alleged has become moot based on the Clifton Board of Education's decisions.

9:47 a.m. Brian Fabiano, Complainant in the matter docketed as C37-22, and interested party in the matter docketed as C85-22, noted his attendance and offered a statement summarized as follows:

Good morning. This is Brian Fabiano. I am calling from Monroe Township. I am calling in regards to the case, is very public case that's been made public in our town, case C85-22, which are added as a court complaint. That was to the Commission. My, my comments are very simple and very quick, and I appreciate the Commission making the time for the public.

This is a, a case that involves conflicts of interest. A board member sitting on the Monroe Township Board of Education. A very, a very, a very, you know, public case obviously because it was a lawsuit that was filed by a member of the public, and I think it's a very important one for the, the members of the public and Monroe Township, as well as the Commission simply for the fact. And that's why I wanted to call. that this regard, this is regarding conflicts of interest that have been uh, at the forefront of a number of cases brought by this Commission, but more importantly, you know, as I understand by you know, this case being made public, that it involves an employee of the district who has since resigned from the district. That was really, you know the subject of some pretty horrible work conditions and you know, maybe some personal animosity from board members who should have recused.

In regard, in regards to a suspension that they brought forward on this particular employee, I think more importantly than probably anything, obviously you know students are important as well. So, it's probably not anything but you know, employees of, of,

public employees of school districts should, you know, should have accountability from this Commission as it regards to, you know, the you know, any wrongdoings towards them made by members of the, members of, you know, board of educations or anyone that this Commission enforces. It's very hard sometimes for as, as, elected officials or appointed officials to this Commission, as I'm sure you're aware, you know, there are times where you have to recuse where you may not necessarily want to recuse, but recusing is the right thing to do because of conflicts. In this case, that seems to be very clear based on the evidence that's presented to the public. And then I'm a member of the public and saying is that, you know, Members who have had long standing animosity towards this particular employee that have always recused, should have recused when it came to a review for him to be suspended from the district. And I think that that speaks mountains and I hope that the Commission, you know, really, you know, looks at this case in, in depth and there seems to be a lot to this, obviously because it was made public through the court case that originated, you know and, and, and, and then went to your group. So, I appreciate, and I know other members that call in from our Township and, and, many townships appreciate the work that you guys do.

It gets burdensome at, at, some points with the amount of complaints that do come before you, this Commission, but there's a lot going on in Monroe Township and I don't think you'd be seeing this level. These level of complaints if, if, if, if it was, you know, the, the little you know, little house on the Prairie. There's, there's some, some, major issues here and I think the Commission needs to take the time to really understand what's happening here as a previous caller said, you know, there are a number of cases that have been put in for, into abeyance. I haven't been able to find that many scenarios where that's happened in other districts and I think it speaks a lot about many members of the public who have come forward to this Commission with concerns and things are starting to stack up and I'm sure that's frustrating on your part. The amount of work that it puts this Commission through, but it's also frustrating on the public's part that sometimes we don't feel like our concerns are being heard and we understand we have to get in line, but things continue to spiral out of control for those who pay attention in our Township and it starts to add up after a while and, and, I and I, would appreciate if this Commission and I know you do take these things serious, and, and, really look at the merits of all cases that have presented, you know, to, to, the Commission, so sorry for being a little bit, uh, one thing in my comments, but I do appreciate all you guys do.

9:52 a.m. Chairperson Bender responded to Mr. Fabiano:

I can tell you from the comment, just one second, Jeannine, just the response to that. I just, I just want them to know that we take every case very seriously. We take the time to review and discuss and also to make sure that it's in compliance with the Code and the Statute. So, we do take the time. Sometimes the process of, sometimes sending it to OAL or whatever it, it slows the process, but it's the process that we have to follow. So again, we want to let you know that we take everything very seriously.

III. Executive Session

At 9:53 a.m., the following **Resolution** was read:

Whereas, the Open Public Meetings Act (*N.J.S.A.* 10:4-6 *et seq.*) authorizes the Commission, a public body, to meet in Executive Session under certain circumstances; and

Whereas, the Open Public Meetings Act requires that the Commission adopt a Resolution at a public meeting to go into Executive Session; and

Now therefore be it resolved that, consistent with the provisions of N.J.A.C. 10:4-12(b), the Commission will adjourn to executive session to discuss matters which, by statute, are regarded as confidential and also to discuss matters possibly involving litigation, specifically: C57-21; C02-22; C69-22; C70-22; C74-22; C79-22; C83-22; C84-22; C85-22; C86-22; C14-22; C27-22; C37-22; C66-22; C67-22; C71-22; C77-22; C80-22; A12-22; A17-21; A02-22; Doctrine of Necessity submitted by the Garfield Board of Education; DAG Fichera to present an update on the status of the settlement offer in connection with C36-21; DAG Fichera to present a settlement offer in connection with C22-22; adoption of Resolution of Removal in connection with D07-22; adoption of Resolution of Removal in connection with D09-22; adoption of Resolution of Suspension in connection with T01-22; follow-up on the status of C82-22; and update on the status of the Commission's proposed Chapter 28 regulations (amendments and readoption) and potential amendments/revisions, if any; and

Now therefore be it further resolved that the Commission will return to open session to conduct business at the conclusion of Executive Session.

Motion was made by Dennis Roberts, and seconded by Carol E. Sabo, to adjourn to Executive Session to discuss the matters set forth in the foregoing Resolution.

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Carol E. Sabo	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X		X	X	X		X	5
No								0
Abstention								0

IV. Return to Public

At **12:32 p.m.**, a motion was made by Dennis Roberts, and seconded by Mark Finkelstein, to return to public session for the purpose of receiving public comment/testimony, and to vote on matters discussed in Executive Session (as appropriate).

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Carol E. Sabo	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X		X	X	X		X	5
No								0
Abstention								0

V. Complaints to Review

C57-21 Motion was made by Dennis Roberts, and seconded by Mark Finkelstein, to draft a decision as discussed.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Carol E. Sabo	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X		X	X	X		X	5
No								0
Abstention								0

C69-22 Motion was made by Mark Finkelstein, and seconded by Richard Tomko, to draft a decision as discussed.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Carol E. Sabo	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X		X	X	X		X	5
No								0
Abstention								0

C70-22 Motion was made by Mark Finkelstein, and seconded by Richard Tomko, to draft a decision as discussed.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Carol E. Sabo	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X		X	X	X		X	5
No								0
Abstention								0

C74-22 Motion was made by Dennis Roberts, and seconded by Carol E. Sabo, to draft a decision as discussed.

Vote

Vote		Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Carol E. Sabo	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X		X	X	X		X	5
No								0
Abstention								0

C79-22 Motion was made by Carol E. Sabo, and seconded by Mark Finkelstein, to draft a decision as discussed.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Carol E. Sabo	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X		X	X	X			4
No								0
Abstention							X^1	1

¹ Commissioner Tomko did not participate in the discussion or the vote related to this matter due to a conflict of interest.

C83-22 Motion was made by Dennis Roberts, and seconded by Mark Finkelstein, to draft a decision as discussed.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Carol E. Sabo	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X		X	X	X		X	5
No								0
Abstention								0

C84-22 Motion was made by Dennis Roberts, and seconded by Carol E. Sabo, to draft a decision as discussed.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Carol E. Sabo	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X		X	5
No							0
Abstention							0

C85-22 Motion was made by Richard Tomko, and seconded by Mark Finkelstein, to draft a decision as discussed.

Vote	Robert Bender	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Carol E. Sabo	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X		X	5
No							0
Abstention							0

C86-22 Motion was made by Dennis Roberts, and seconded by Carol E. Sabo, to draft a letter decision as discussed.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Carol E. Sabo	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X		X	X	X		X	5
No								0
Abstention								0

VI. Decisions to Adopt as Written²

C02-22³ Motion was made by Dennis Roberts, and seconded by Mark Finkelstein, to adopt the decision as written.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Carol E. Sabo	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X		X	X	X		X	5
No								0
Abstention								0

C14-22 Motion was made by Dennis Roberts, and seconded by Mark Finkelstein, to adopt the decision as written.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Carol E. Sabo	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes			X	X	X			3
No								0
Abstention	X						X	2

² Chairperson Bender and Commissioner Tomko were not present at the special meeting on October 17, 2022, and, therefore, did not participate in the votes related to these matters.

³ This matter was listed under "Complaints to Review," and under "Decisions to Adopt" at the November 22, 2022, meeting.

C27-22 Motion was made by Dennis Roberts, and seconded by Mark Finkelstein, to adopt the decision as written.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Carol E. Sabo	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes		X	X	X			3
No							0
Abstention	X					X	2

C37-22 Motion was made by Dennis Roberts, and seconded by Mark Finkelstein, to adopt the decision as written.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Carol E. Sabo	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes		X	X	X			3
No							0
Abstention	X ⁴					X ⁵	2

C66-22 Motion was made by Dennis Roberts, and seconded by Mark Finkelstein, to adopt the decision as written.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Carol E. Sabo	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes		X	X	X			3
No							0
Abstention	X					X	2

⁴ Chairperson Bender was not present at the special meeting on October 17, 2022, and therefore, did not participate in the vote related to this matter, or any other matter listed under "Decisions to Adopt." Chairperson Bender participated in the vote regarding C02-22 because it was also discussed at the meeting on November 22, 2022.

⁵ Commissioner Tomko was not present at the special meeting on October 17, 2022, and therefore, did not participate in the vote related to this matter, or any other matter listed under "Decisions to Adopt." Commissioner Tomko participated in the vote regarding C02-22 because it was also discussed at the meeting on November 22, 2022.

C67-22 Motion was made by Dennis Roberts, and seconded by Mark Finkelstein, to adopt the decision as written.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Carol E. Sabo	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes		X	X	X			3
No							0
Abstention	X					X	2

C71-22 Motion was made by Dennis Roberts, and seconded by Mark Finkelstein, to adopt the decision as amended.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Carol E. Sabo	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes		X	X	X			3
No							0
Abstention	X					X	2

C77-22 Motion was made by Dennis Roberts, and seconded by Mark Finkelstein, to adopt the decision as written.

Vote	Robert Bender	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Carol E. Sabo	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes		X	X	X			3
No							0
Abstention	X					X	2

C80-22 Motion was made by Dennis Roberts, and seconded by Mark Finkelstein, to adopt the decision as written.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Carol E. Sabo	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes		X	X	X			3
No							0
Abstention	X					X	2

VII. Advisory Opinions

A12-22 Motion was made by Mark Finkelstein, and seconded by Richard Tomko, to adopt the advisory opinion as written.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Carol E. Sabo	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X		X	5
No							0
Abstention							0

- A12-22 This matter was also on the agenda to make public. However, action could not be taken because the Commission did not have the statutorily required number of Commissioners present to make the advisory opinion public
- A17-21 This matter was on the agenda to make public only, but action could not be taken because the Commission did not have the statutorily required number of Commissioners present to make the advisory opinion public.
- A02-22 This matter was on the agenda to make public only, but action could not be taken because the Commission did not have the statutorily required number of Commissioners present to make the advisory opinion public.

VIII. Other Business

Doctrine of Necessity: Garfield Board of Education. This matter was on the agenda for informational purposes only.

DAG Laurie Fichera to present an update on the status of the settlement offer in connection with C36-21. This matter was on the agenda for informational purposes only.

DAG Fichera to present settlement offer in connection with C22-22. This matter was on the agenda for informational purposes only.

Adoption of Resolution of Removal in connection with D07-22. Motion was made by Dennis Roberts, and seconded by Carol E. Sabo, to adopt the Resolution as written

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Carol E. Sabo	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X		X	5
No							0
Abstention							0

Adoption of Resolution of Removal in connection with D09-22. Motion was made by Dennis Roberts, and seconded by Carol E. Sabo, to adopt the Resolution as written

Vote	Robert Bender	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Carol E. Sabo	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X		X	5
No							0
Abstention							0

Adoption of Resolution of Suspension in connection with T01-22. Motion was made by Dennis Roberts, and seconded by Carol E. Sabo, to adopt the Resolution as written

Vote

Vote		Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Carol E. Sabo	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X		X	X	X		X	5
No								0
Abstention								0

Follow-up on the status of C82-22. This matter was on the agenda for informational purposes only.

Update on the status of the School Ethics Commission's proposed Chapter 28 regulations.

This matter was on the agenda for informational purposes only.

IX. Minutes

Motion was made by Dennis Roberts, and seconded by Mark Finkelstein, to adopt the minutes of the special meeting (public and executive) conducted on October 17, 2022.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Carol E. Sabo	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes		X	X	X			3
No							0
Abstention	X ⁶					X ⁷	2

X. Second Public Comment

Members of the public in attendance at the meeting were again invited to offer public comment/statements regarding any matter on the Commission's Agenda.

12:33 p.m. Thomas Whittles, member of the public, noted his attendance, but did not offer any public comments/statements.

⁶ Chairperson Bender was not present at the special meeting on October 17, 2022, and therefore, did not participate in the vote related to this matter.

⁷ Commissioner Tomko was not present at the special meeting on October 17, 2022, and therefore, did not participate in the vote related to this matter.

- **12:33 p.m.** Brian Fabiano, Complainant in the matter docketed as C37-22, and interested party in the matter docketed as C85-22, again noted his attendance, but did not offer any further public comments/statements.
- **12:33 p.m.** Bhargavi Akiri, Respondent in the matter docketed as C67-22, noted her attendance, but did not offer any public comments/statements.
- **12:34 p.m.** Lauren Connell-Madia, counsel on behalf of Respondent in the matters docketed as C69-22 and C70-22, again noted her attendance and offered a statement summarized as follows:

I have the same comment as this morning that umm, the Complaint is moot.

- **12:35 p.m.** Alyssa Weinstein, counsel on behalf of Respondent in the matter docketed as C71-22, noted her attendance, but did not offer any public comments/statements.
- **12:35 p.m.** Judith Bassford, Respondent in the matter docketed as C7o-22, noted her attendance, but did not offer any public comments/statements.
- **12:47 p.m.** Chairperson Bender acknowledged the work of one of the Commission's staff members, Mary Silvestro, and noted the Commission's appreciation for the work she has done for the Commission and for her years of service to the Department.
- **12:48 p.m.** Commissioner Roberts congratulated Ms. Silvestro and wished her well in her retirement. The remaining Commissioners agreed with Chairperson Bender and Commissioner Roberts and noted their agreement.

XII. Adjournment

Prior to adjournment, Chairperson Bender acknowledged the more than 10 years of service provided by Mary Silvestro, who is retiring from employment. On behalf of the Commission, Chairperson Bender thanked Ms. Silvestro for her service, and wished her well in retirement.

At 12:49 p.m., a motion was made by Dennis Roberts, and seconded by Carol E. Sabo, to adjourn.

Vote	Robert Bender	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Carol E. Sabo	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X		X	5
No							0
Abstention							0

Submitted by:
Jeannine Pizzigoni
Approved by
Kathryn A. Whalen, Esq., Director,
School Ethics Commission